

Simon J.G. Burton /
Michał Choptiany / Piotr Wilczek (eds.)

Protestant Majorities and Minorities in Early Modern Europe

Confessional Boundaries and
Contested Identities



Academic Studies

53



Refo500 Academic Studies

Edited by
Herman J. Selderhuis

In Co-operation with
Christopher B. Brown (Boston), Günter Frank (Bretten),
Bruce Gordon (New Haven), Barbara Mahlmann-Bauer (Bern),
Tarald Rasmussen (Oslo), Violet Soen (Leuven),
Zsombor Tóth (Budapest), Günther Wassilowsky (Linz),
Siegfried Westphal (Osnabrück).

Volume 53

Simon J.G. Burton/Michał Choptiany/
Piotr Wilczek (eds.)

Protestant Majorities and Minorities in Early Modern Europe

Confessional Boundaries and Contested Identities

Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek:
The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie;
detailed bibliographic data available online: <http://dnb.de>.

© 2019, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht GmbH & Co. KG, Theaterstraße 13, D-37073 Göttingen
All rights reserved. No part of this work may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means,
electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage and
retrieval system, without prior written permission from the publisher.

Typesetting: 3w+p, Rimpär
Printed and bound: Hubert & Co. BuchPartner, Göttingen
Printed in the EU

Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht Verlage | www.vandenhoeck-ruprecht-verlage.com

ISSN 2197-0165
ISBN 978-3-647-57129-4

Contents

Simon J.G. Burton/Michał Choptiany/Piotr Wilczek Introduction	9
--	---

I. Intellectual Culture and Confessional Freedom

Gábor Ittzés From Bullinger to Specker and Garcaeus. The Reformed Origins of the Lutheran Doctrine of the Immortality of the Soul in the Sixteenth Century	21
--	----

Alessandra Celati A Peculiar Reformed Minority. Italian Heretical Physicians between Religious Propaganda, Inquisitorial Repression and Freedom of Thought	39
--	----

Simon J.G. Burton From Minority Discourse to Universal Method. Polish Chapters in the Evolution of Ramism	61
---	----

II. Clandestine Reformation

Christopher Matthews A Reformed Hiding Place in Sixteenth-Century Seville. The Significance of the Monastery of St. Isidore	91
---	----

José Moreno Berrocal <i>Sola Scriptura</i> . The Rationale behind the Early Protestant Translations of the Spanish Bible	107
--	-----

Frances Luttikhuizen Clandestine Protestant Literature Reaches Spain	129
---	-----

III. Refugee Reformation

Barbara A. Kaminska

A Religious Minority between Triumph and Persecution. Frans Hogenberg's *Hedge-preaching outside Antwerp* and the Flemish Community in Cologne 149

Leon van den Broeke

Acceptance and Organisation of the French Protestants in the Northern Netherlands. A Reformed Minority within the Reformed Majority 171

IV. Marginal Reformation

Felicita Tramontana

An Unusual Setting. Interactions between Protestants and Catholics in the Ottoman Empire 189

Mihály Balázs

Aus der Mehrheit in die Minderheit. Der Weg des siebenbürgischen Antitrinitarismus im 16.–17. Jahrhundert 213

Borbála Lovas

On the Margins of the Reformation. The “Local” and the “International” in György Enyedi's Manuscript Sermons and Printed Works 231

V. Confessional Identity and Otherness

Magdalena Luszczynska

Inter-Faith Disputation, Christian Hebraism, or a Leadership Campaign? The Multi-Dimensional Character of Marcin Czechowic's Anti-Jewish Polemics 251

Joanna Partyka

British Protestants and Women's Freedom to Write 271

Paweł Rutkowski

Papists, Frogs and Witches. Representing Quakers in Seventeenth-Century England 285

Jakub Koryl

Sources of Community. Mythical Groundwork of Early Modern Identities 303

Notes on the contributors	335
Index of Places	339
Index of People	343

Simon J.G. Burton/Michał Choptiany/Piotr Wilczek

Introduction

This volume contains papers drawn from the international RefoRC colloquium on “Reformed Majorities and Minorities: Confessional Boundaries and Contested Identities”. This took place in the Faculty of *Artes Liberales* at the University of Warsaw on September 22–24 2014. It was organised by the then Commission for the Study of the Reformation in Poland and East-Central Europe (now the Centre for the Study of the Reformation and Intellectual Culture in Early Modern Europe) in collaboration with RefoRC, the Johannes a Lasco Bibliothek, Emden and the Tolle Lege Institute, Warsaw. The organisers of the colloquium, who are also the editors of this volume, are especially grateful to Professor Jerzy Axer, the former Dean of the Faculty of *Artes Liberales*, for permission to use the Faculty buildings and for financial support, to Professor Herman J. Selderhuis and Dr Karla Apperloo-Boersma of RefoRC for administrative and financial support, and to Dr Dariusz Bryćko of the Tolle Lege Institute for the generous financial contribution of his organisation.

This volume is intended as a companion volume to *Reformed Majorities in Early Modern Europe* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2015), edited by Herman Selderhuis and J. Marius Lange van Ravenswaay. This marked the principal output of an earlier international RefoRC conference “Reformed Majorities and Minorities in Early Modern Europe”, organised by the Johannes a Lasco Bibliothek, Emden in co-operation with the Faculty of *Artes Liberales* of the University of Warsaw, which took place in Emden in 2013. As originally envisaged the Warsaw colloquium of 2014 was intended to cover Reformed minorities and to consider the way in which Reformed institutions and individuals dealt in theory and practice with the relation between doctrine and tolerance. In fact, as indicated below, the colloquium and resulting volume ended up embracing a wider inter-confessional and even (to some extent) inter-religious scope. For this reason the decision was taken to change the name of the volume to *Protestant Majorities and Minorities in Early Modern Europe: Confessional Boundaries and Contested Identities*. Nevertheless, the identity and experience of Reformed minorities, in both a strict and broad sense, remains

central to this volume. Likewise, there are many important thematic continuities which bind the two volumes together, providing a linking narrative on minority and refugee experience to complement the earlier focus on Reformed majorities.

The volume itself is organised into five sections: I) Intellectual Culture and Confessional Freedom, II) Clandestine Reformation, III) Refugee Reformation, IV) Marginal Reformation and V) Confessional Identity and Otherness. Each of these presents a different aspect of the relation between religious majorities and minorities in early modern Europe, while cumulatively they offer a view of the complex intellectual, social, economic, political, and, of course, theological and ecclesiastical factors that shaped the dynamics of intra- and inter-confessional encounter. While by no means comprehensive in scope or intention, the different chapters in the volume cover a wide geographical area and interact with an impressive array of confessions.

The first section explores intellectual trajectories, especially those which promoted confessional unity or sought to break down confessional boundaries. The second section, taking the neglected Spanish Reformation as an important case-study, examines the clandestine aspect of minority activities and the efforts of majorities to control and suppress them. It also highlights the way in which Reformed minorities could be empowered through their connections to an international movement. The third section pursues a similar theme but examines it through the lens of Flemish and Walloon Reformed refugee communities in Germany and the Netherlands, demonstrating the way in which confessional factors could lead to the integration or exclusion of minorities. The fourth section examines marginal Reformations, whether geographically or doctrinally understood, focussing on attempts to implement reform in the shadow of the Ottoman Empire. Finally, the fifth section looks at confessional identity and otherness as a principal theme of majority and minority relations, providing both theoretical and practical frameworks for its evaluation.

I. Intellectual Culture and Confessional Freedom

Gábor Ittész' chapter "From Bullinger to Specker and Garcaeus: The Reformed Origins of the Lutheran Doctrine of the Immortality of the Soul in the Sixteenth Century" considers an important theme of philosophical debate in the early modern period and the way in which it crossed confessional boundaries. While Martin Luther's own views of the soul's immortality were often viewed with suspicion, the doctrine later became a central tenet of Lutheran orthodoxy. Ittész' paper examines this transformation by means of a detailed textual study of the work of two lesser known sixteenth-century Lutheran theologians: Melchior Specker and Johannes Garcaeus Jr. He demonstrates that both of these authors

drew extensively on a sermon by Heinrich Bullinger, the influential Swiss Reformed theologian. As Ittzés suggests, at a time when Lutheran and Reformed theologians were increasingly at odds confessionally, their common stance with respect to the immortality of the soul shows the ongoing potential for philosophical and theological cross-fertilisation between rival communities.

Questions surrounding the soul are also at the heart of Alessandra Celati's chapter "A Peculiar Reformed Minority: Italian Protestant Physicians between Religious Propaganda, Inquisitorial Repression and Freedom of Thought". This focusses on the reception of the Reformation in the sixteenth-century Italian medical community and its impact on the wider horizon of the European Reformation, especially in its radical streams. Celati shows that the physician's office as doctors of body and soul, gave them an important spiritual role in their communities, frequently causing them to come into conflict with the Inquisition. The records of the Inquisition show that many Italian doctors were attracted to Reformed doctrine. However, their own education and especially its radical Aristotelian (Averroistic) tenor, often led these same doctors to unconventional views of the soul and its relation to God. In advocating an unprecedented freedom of thought, Celati shows how they sought to overcome religious boundaries at the very moment when the different confessions were entrenching themselves, ever more deeply, in positions of doctrinal rigidity.

A similar desire to break down traditional boundaries, albeit towards a very different end, was in evidence in early modern Ramism, which is the subject of Simon Burton's chapter "From Minority Discourse to Universal Method: Polish Chapters in the Evolution of Ramism". Burton examines aspects of the complex evolution of Ramism in the seventeenth century, examining especially the tension between its increasing marginalisation and its universalist aspirations. In particular, he considers the way in which both pragmatic and theological considerations motivated the adoption of Ramism in minority contexts and fuelled its ongoing transformation. The first case-study focusses on Bartholomäus Keckermann, one of the leading intellectuals of the early seventeenth century. Keckermann's own desire to relieve the embattled Reformed community of his native Danzig, under siege from a hostile Lutheran majority, led him from being a critic of Ramist educational methods to becoming a pioneer in their adaptation. This leads into discussion of Jan Amos Comenius, the visionary Czech philosopher and theologian. Even more than Keckermann, Comenius saw the potential of Ramism to contribute to the reform and reunification of divided Christendom. From Keckermann to Comenius (via Johann Heinrich Alsted) we can therefore chart the way in which different minority experiences, within the broader Reformed community, shaped the evolution of Ramism and prepared the way for universal reformation.

II. Clandestine Reformation

Christopher Matthews' chapter "A Reformed Hiding Place in Sixteenth-Century Seville: The Significance of the Monastery of St Isidore" provides a window onto the history of an influential Spanish monastery, that of St Isidore's in Seville, from its early origins and expansion during the Reconquista to its startling transformation in the sixteenth century from a Catholic beacon of reform into a secret Protestant seminary. In doing so Matthews demonstrates the deep and surprising roots of Spanish Protestantism in the intellectual and spiritual reforms of Isidore of Seville and of the Hieronymite Order of observant monks who followed in his footsteps. He offers an account of the clandestine life these monks led in their efforts to spread the Gospel among Spanish clergy and academics and to promote Bible study and translation. Ultimately, however, their close connections with the underground Protestant Church in Seville led to their discovery by the Inquisition, causing many to become refugees and to make their abodes in Protestant centres across Europe. However, while today the Monastery of St Isidore stands empty, its legacy lives on in the Spanish churches, both Catholic majority and Protestant minority, which have benefitted from its monks and especially their work of translation.

In "*Sola Scriptura: The Rationale behind the Early Protestant Translations of the Spanish Bible*", José Moreno Berrocal reminds us that in the early modern period Bible translation could often be a minority pursuit in the face of a very hostile majority. Through a detailed examination of the lives and witness of three brave Protestant translators – Francisco de Enzinas (Francis Dryander), Juan Pérez de Pineda and Casiodoro de Reina – he shows the way in which the minority attempt to provide a Spanish translation of the Bible, which had its beginning in Catholic reform circles, became an international endeavour, eventually involving Reformed intellectual and printing networks across Europe. Even more importantly, however, Moreno Berrocal examines the theological roots of this endeavour in Protestant convictions about the authority of the Word of God and the internal testimony of the Holy Spirit. In doing so he demonstrates the way in which these translators sought to appeal to the hearts and minds of their Spanish brethren in an effort to turn their minority position into a majority one.

Matthews' and Moreno Berrocal's accounts are nicely complemented by Frances Luttikhuisen's chapter "Clandestine Protestant Literature Reaches Spain", which examines in more depth the underground book trade which nourished the Spanish Protestant Church and particularly the reforming intellectuals of St Isidore's. In the process Luttikhuisen also highlights censorship as an important instrument which was frequently used by early modern majorities in their efforts to control and suppress minority viewpoints. In the

Spanish context this tightening of regulations affected not only the Protestant minority but also the increasingly marginalised reforming Catholics, who early in the sixteenth century had looked set to become a dominant majority. Nevertheless, Luttikhuizen shows how, by exploiting their connections with international networks of Reformed printers and booksellers, Spanish Protestants were able to smuggle into Spain a remarkable number of Bibles and religious books. Once again the minority situation of a beleaguered Protestant community is shown to be more complex than it might appear at first sight.

III. Refugee Reformation

Barbara Kaminska's chapter "A Religious Minority between Triumph and Persecution: Frans Hogenberg's *Hedge-Preaching outside Antwerp* and the Flemish Community in Cologne" examines the remarkable phenomenon of Protestant hedge-preaching during the Dutch Wonder Year of 1566–1567, and its intriguing afterlife in the engravings of Frans Hogenberg, himself a Protestant refugee from the Low Countries. By comparison with official documentation of the hedge-preaching, Kaminska shows how Hogenberg subtly manipulated the facts in his own representation of a famous outdoor sermon which took place outside Antwerp in order to legitimate his own, minority, interpretation of the events. In sharp contrast with the triumphant tone of other contemporary Protestant accounts, Hogenberg chose to emphasise the divisive potential of the field-preaching, especially its role in splitting the Walloon Reformed, Flemish Reformed and Lutheran Churches. At the same time he sought to neutralise the radical political elements of the preaching and to present it as a necessary reaction against the corruption of the Catholic Church. In doing so, Kaminska suggests, he aimed both to stimulate reflection and reconciliation among newly divided Protestant communities and to secure Cologne and other German cities as a safe-haven for the refugees by convincing sceptics of the legitimacy of their revolt.

Leon van den Broeke's chapter "Acceptance and Organisation of the French Protestants in the Northern Netherlands: A Reformed Minority within the Reformed Majority" presents us with another unusual encounter between majority and minority. Focussing on the French-speaking Walloon Church he examines the circumstances and conditions of their acceptance and integration into the Reformed Church of the Netherlands. Van den Broeke argues that while the Walloons were welcomed into the Netherlands on both compassionate and economic grounds, it was their shared Reformed faith which allowed them to integrate so well. For this allowed them to develop their own Church order, with their own French pastors, liturgy and even academy, but at the same time to slot

into the established synodical system of Church government. In this way they retained their own distinct identity as a community, which was for a long time protected by generous privileges granted by the Dutch government, and also gained an important voice in Dutch affairs. Ultimately, however, their very success led to their almost complete assimilation into Dutch culture, leading to the Walloon Church today having become a near invisible minority.

IV. Marginal Reformation

Traditional research on early modern relations between Catholics and Protestants has focussed on the European context, in which one of the two confessions almost invariably exercised a dominant majority role over the other. Felicita Tramontana's chapter "An Unusual Setting: Interactions between Protestants and Catholics in the Ottoman Empire" presents an alternative, non-European, perspective, drawing our attention to the fortunes of the early modern Protestant and Catholic communities of the Ottoman Empire. In this unusual setting both groups were minorities under Muslim rule and the majority Christian group was the Orthodox Church. Through detailed consideration of the correspondence between Catholic priests and missionaries and the Holy Office in Rome, Tramontana provides us with an on-the-ground account of the dynamics of Tridentine Confessionalisation. In particular, she examines the tension between Rome's recognition of the pragmatic reality of Catholic life in the Ottoman Empire, in which amicable contact between Protestants and Catholics was both inevitable and essential for the survival of both communities, and their desire to establish a robust oriental Catholic identity as an effective counter-measure against the incursions of Orthodox Christianity.

Mihály Balázs' chapter "Aus der Mehrheit in die Minderheit: Der Weg des siebenbürgischen Antitrinitarismus im 16.–17. Jahrhundert" focusses on the Anti-Trinitarian community in Transylvania, a principality on the edge of the Ottoman Empire, and their journey from influential majority to marginalised minority. While many scholars have blamed the Anti-Trinitarians for their own demise, especially due to their internal theological dissensions and radical views, Balázs takes a different view. He argues that the Transylvanian Anti-Trinitarians, despite their prevalent and highly controversial Non-Adorantist stance on Christ, had a surprisingly international and inclusive perspective. This was markedly different from the Sabbatarians, with whom they are usually compared, who dwindled into a sect. Rather, like the Polish Anti-Trinitarians, with whom they were closely connected, the Transylvanian Anti-Trinitarians shared the view that they had been given a special role by God for the renewal of all Christendom. Drawing on the writings of the Polish-Lithuanian Anti-Trinitarian Szymon

Budny and the Transylvanian Anti-Trinitarian György Enyedi, Balázs reveals their theological arguments for a universal Christianity, which were for the latter even capable of embracing both Trinitarians and Anti-Trinitarians, and their openness to political involvement and alliance. However, he concludes that political changes in Hungary and Transylvania, a rising Anti-Ottoman sentiment and increasing confessionalisation during the seventeenth century left no room for this kind of radical irenicism.

Borbála Lovas' chapter "On the Margins of the Reformation: The "Local" and the "International" in György Enyedi's Manuscript Sermons and Printed Works" complements Balázs' chapter in providing a detailed account of the struggle of the Anti-Trinitarian minority in Transylvania against Catholic and Reformed opposition. She focusses on György Enyedi, who was actually bishop of the Anti-Trinitarians, and the complex legacy of his published works and manuscript sermons. Enyedi's sermons were preached at a time when the Anti-Trinitarians, following the death of their patron Prince John Sigismund Zapolya, were in danger of losing their majority position. In them, Enyedi attacks the princes for deserting the Anti-Trinitarian cause and calls on the Transylvanians, as a chosen nation, to establish the true Christian religion in Europe. Later, however, as Lovas establishes, the sermons were adapted to become a principal source for Enyedi's *Explicationes*, his major theological work against the Trinity. In the seventeenth century this became a target not only for Catholic, Reformed and Lutheran theologians across Europe but the centre of an inter-confessional battle between the new Reformed majority, sponsored by the Calvinist princes, and the now embattled Anti-Trinitarian minority. In this we see how sermons delivered to a minority in a marginal principality could have Europe-wide repercussions.

V. Confessional Identity and Otherness

Magdalena Luszczynska's chapter "Inter-Faith Disputation, Christian-Hebraism or a Leadership Campaign?: The Multi-Dimensional Character of Marcin Czechowic's Anti-Jewish Polemics" presents an account of the way in which Marcin Czechowic, a theologian of the Polish Brethren, exploited the "otherness" of the Jewish faith in order both to distance himself and his Anti-Trinitarian views from accusations of "Judaising" and to position himself as the natural leader of the Anti-Trinitarians. Examining in detail Czechowic's Anti-Jewish polemics, which were written in the form of dialogue with a Jewish Rabbi, Luszczynska shows how Czechowic's inter-faith discussion with a Jew became the implicit framework for intra-faith discussion with his Anti-Trinitarian rivals. In particular, by presenting himself as a deeply-learned Christian Hebraist – a veneer, as Luszczynska demonstrates – he was able to cleverly address the issues of pre-existence and

adorantism which were at that time beginning to divide the Polish Anti-Trinitarians. In this way Czechowicz sought to unify the Polish Brethren, as well as to defend their own minority understanding as the true meaning of Christian Scripture.

Joanna Partyka's chapter "British Protestants and Women's Freedom to Write", which focusses on female writers from a Puritan and Quaker background, offers a compelling account of a minority within a minority. The early modern period saw a dramatic rise in female literacy, leading to a significant number of women becoming writers. Partyka, like other scholars before her, links this trend to the Protestant, especially Puritan, habit of writing a spiritual journal which took off in the sixteenth century. She argues that this task, perceived by many as a spiritual duty, provided an outlet not only for religious sentiment and ideals but also for female creativity. Indeed, in writers such as Lucy Hutchinson and Anne Dudley Bradstreet we see a flowering of early modern female literature and poetry. Writing therefore became an important way for this particular minority to express themselves, and voice their own female *and* Puritan views of the world. While in the sixteenth-century Puritan movement female writing largely remained within the bounds of societal norms and expectations, the seventeenth century saw the rise of the Quakers. Taking advantage of their opportunity to write, Quaker women like Margaret Fell used it to promote controversial female preaching and leadership roles. Paradoxically, therefore, the Puritan minority, which many scholars have simplistically viewed as oppressive and patriarchal, gave rise to important expressions of feminine spirituality and freedom.

Paweł Rutkowski's chapter "Papists, Frogs and Witches: Representing Quakers in Seventeenth-Century England" also centres on the Quakers, but this time from the perspective of their hostile Anglican and Puritan opponents. He shows how in their struggle to understand and contain this new, revolutionary spiritual movement, which was perceived as deeply threatening both to key Protestant doctrines and English societal norms, Anglicans and Puritans alike turned to stereotypical views of the "other". In particular, Rutkowski argues that portraying Quakers as Catholic conspirators, witches and even beasts was a way of making sense of their unusual theological views and social radicalism and justifying their ongoing persecution. For many these images were not mutually exclusive but rather fit together into a master narrative according to which the Pope was using an alliance of counterfeit Protestants and unholy powers to undermine the Protestant Church in England and bring it back under the thrall of the papacy. It was only when the Quakers toned down their radical views in the later seventeenth century that they could be accepted and tolerated as a religious minority and absorbed into the new Protestant pluralistic settlement.

Jakub Koryl's lengthy chapter, "Sources of Community: Mythical Groundwork of Early Modern Identities", stands out in terms of its theoretical nature

and comprehensive scope. At the same time it goes to the heart of the question of confessional identity and otherness, and thus provides an illuminating perspective on many of the themes covered in both this section and the volume as a whole. Drawing on case-studies from both the Lutheran and Catholic Reformation, Koryl seeks to offer a new account of confessional-identity building from the late Middle Ages through to the Enlightenment. In particular, he argues that in the early modern period the theme of myth – and especially the rival German and Roman “myths” of Reformation – became the driving force for the creation of new confessional identities, harnessing and uniting into one powerful synthesis, social, intellectual, political and religious forces. Then, following in the footsteps of Hans Blumenberg, Charles Taylor and others, Koryl traces the roots of the modern conception of identity to late medieval Nominalism and its overturning of the medieval analogical and hierarchical understanding of reality. According to Koryl, it was this philosophical move which helped release the creative – and destructive – interplay of forces that shaped the early modern confessional landscape for the next two centuries. Importantly, this situation gave minority views a new voice in European affairs, allowing them eventually to construct their own (secular) myths and take on the dominant, majority role they exercise in the world today.

Edinburgh/Warsaw/Washington, D.C.,
19 December 2018

Simon J.G. Burton
Michał Choptiany
Piotr Wilczek

I. Intellectual Culture and Confessional Freedom

Gábor Ittzés

From Bullinger to Specker and Garcaeus

The Reformed Origins of the Lutheran Doctrine of the Immortality of the Soul in the Sixteenth Century

1. Introduction

In the second half of the sixteenth century, German Lutheran theologians developed a robust doctrine of the immortality of the soul. The body of literature they produced covers a broad range in geographical, cultural, and temporal terms.¹ Yet the teaching was quite consistent, which may in part be due to the fact

1 Abbreviations

- ADB Allgemeine Deutsche Biographie, 56 vols. (Berlin: Duncker & Humblot, 1875–1912), online, www.deutsche-biographie.de.
- BBKL Biographisch-bibliographisches Kirchenlexikon, gen. eds. Frierich-Wilhelm Bautz and Traugott Bautz, 36 vols. to date (Hamm/Herzberg/Nordhausen: Bautz, 1990–), online edition: www.bbkl.de.
- DS Heinrich Denzinger, Peter Hünemann and Helmut Hopping (eds.) (2005), *Enchiridion symbolorum definitionum et declarationum de rebus fidei et morum / Kompendium der Glaubensbekenntnisse und kirchlichen Lehrentscheidungen*, German trans. by Peter Hünemann and Helmut Hopping, 40th edition, Freiburg: Herder. English trans. from the 30th edition: *The Sources of Catholic Dogma*, trans. Roy J. Deferrari, St. Louis: Herder, 1957.
- NDB Neue Deutsche Biographie, 25 vols. to date (Berlin: Duncker & Humblot, 1953–), online edition: www.deutsche-biographie.de.
- VD16 Verzeichnis der im deutschen Sprachbereich erschienenen Drucke des 16. Jahrhunderts (www.vd16.de).
- WBIS World Biographical Information System (WBIS) Online (Munich: Saur), <http://db.saur.de/WBIS>.

The works, in chronological order, include but are not limited to Melchior Specker's *Vom Leiblichen Todt* (Strasbourg, 1560), Andreas Musculus' *Gelegenheit/Thun vnd Wesen der Verstorbenen* (Frankfurt a. d. O., 1565), Basilius Faber's *Tractetlein von den Seelen der verstorbenen* (Leipzig, 1569), Johannes Garcaeus, Jr.'s *Sterbbüchlein* (Wittenberg, 1573), Martin Mirus' *Sieben Christliche Predigten* (preached in Regensburg, 1575, first printed in Erfurt, 1590), David Chyträus, Sr.'s *De morte et vita aeterna* (Wittenberg, 1581–1582, German trans. by

that these works constitute an intricate web of interconnected texts. Later authors not infrequently quoted or paraphrased, usually without acknowledgement, earlier writings from the corpus. To prove that claim would require complex philological arguments, which I cannot pursue here. What I offer in this paper instead is an analysis of some formative influences on two, interrelated, early examples of this tradition.

My contention is that Zurich Reformer Heinrich Bullinger's work, especially his sermon "Of the Reasonable Soul of Man; and of His Most Certain Salvation after the Death of His Body" (Bullinger: 1849–1852, 3:365–408) is a tangible source of both Melchior Specker's 1560 florilegium *Vom Leiblichen Todt* and Johannes Garcaeus, Jr.'s *Sterbbüchlein* (1573). If that claim can be substantiated, which I will hope to do in this paper, and if my larger thesis about Lutheran eschatological thought holds, which I will assume rather than argue here, then Bullinger's significance extends far beyond the works which absorbed its impact initially. Through their transmission, the Swiss Reformed theologian's influence ultimately informed the development of North German Lutheran teaching about the *Zwischenzustand*, the soul's immortality and the interim state between the body's death and resurrection.

The doctrine of the immortality of the soul is not a central tenet of the Reformation, but it can offer an interesting case study for the process of confessionalisation. On the eve of the Reformation, Lateran V (1512–1517) declared the immortality of the human soul.² Luther's polemic against the council is well known, and his opposition is often interpreted as a rejection of that doctrine.³ Calvin, on the other hand, was a staunch supporter of the immortality of the soul against the Anabaptists. He dedicated his theological maiden work to this issue,⁴ and it has been suggested that an unnamed but implied opponent of his on this point was Luther himself (George: 1987, 310–311). Luther's views need careful evaluation, especially as Melancthon also produced a forceful defence of the doctrine of immortality in the last chapter of his *De anima* commentary (1544, 303–315), which was first published in Luther's lifetime in Wittenberg, hardly without his knowledge and consent. Be that as it may, after mid-century there

Heinrich Rätel, Berlin/Frankfurt a. d. O., 1590–1591), Moses Pflacher's *Die gantze Lehr Vom Tod vnd Absterben des Menschen* (Frankfurt a. M., 1582), and Georg Weiser's *Christlicher Bericht* (Bautzen/Eisleben, 1583). All works were reprinted, some many times and well into the seventeenth century, often at different places.

2 Apostolici regiminis, 19 December 1513; cf. DS 1440 (English trans. #738).

3 A major twentieth-century theological debate swirled around Luther's views and resulted in a flood of contributions. For the origins of the debate, see Stange: 1925 and 1926, and Althaus: 1926 and 1930; for more recent positions, see, e. g., Heidler: 1983, and Thiede: 1982 and 1993; and for a helpful overview, cf. Lohse: 1999, 325–329.

4 The *Psychopannychia* was written in 1534 although its publication (1542) postdates the first edition of the *Institutes* in 1536.

emerged a full-bodied doctrine of immortality among Lutheran thinkers. Its critical edge was directed against Catholic teaching, especially the doctrine of purgatory, but it proved non-divisive between the Swiss and the German branches of the Reformation. Whatever the apparent distance between Luther's and Calvin's positions in this matter, the gap was narrowed rather than reinforced or widened in the course of the century, despite the Crypto-Calvinist controversies, which were arguably the bitterest of all intra-Lutheran disputes. By the time the minority status of Reformed positions was sealed with the ascendancy of the *Book of Concord* (1580) in Lutheran lands, the Swiss impact had been absorbed so widely and deeply by the evangelicals of the North that it had become part and parcel of the majority view. Bullinger's teaching as mediated by Specker and Garcaeus, which I will explore on the following pages, probably played an important part in that process.

2. Authors and Texts

Heinrich Bullinger (1504–1575) is best known as Zwingli's successor in Zurich after the latter's death at the Battle of Kappel in 1531, which also forced the former to flee his native Bremgarten, where he had been an evangelical pastor for two years. It is often lamented that his recognition does not match his importance, although he has been called "an architect of the Reformation" (Gordon/Campi: 2004) and, already in his lifetime, a "father of the Reformed church" (Blanke: 1990). The 500th anniversary of his birth in 2004 spurred renewed interest in his work, and the literature produced in recent years has to some extent rectified that undervaluation.⁵

Bullinger left a copious oeuvre, comprising well over 120 works. His correspondence, estimated at 12,000 letters, exceeds not only Melancthon's but also Luther's, Calvin's and Erasmus' *combined*.⁶ Of his theological writings, a collection of fifty sermons arranged into groups of ten, and hence called *Sermonum decades quinque*, is widely considered the most important. Written in Latin, they were first published as a series of "decades" from the late 1540s onwards, and translations already began to appear then. Vernacular versions became known under the title *Hausbuch/House Book*. The first full Latin edition was issued in Zurich in 1552 (VD16: B 9696), and the work not only proved an immediate and

5 Basic information has long been readily available on him in standard handbooks, cf., e.g., ADB 3:513–514, NDB 3:12, BBKL 1:809–811. See also Gordon: 2002, with a helpful short bibliography of major contributions from the second half of the twentieth century. Of recent book-length re-evaluations, see especially Campi/Opitz: 2007.

6 Cf. the project website on the homepage of the Institute of Swiss Reformation Studies at <http://www.irg.uzh.ch/hbbw.html>.

exceptional publication success⁷ but has remained in print ever since.⁸ It is a bulky work of some 1,800 pages in which Bullinger treats fundamental loci of Christian theology such as the Word of God, faith, justification, the Ten Commandments, the Apostles' Creed, the Trinity, offices, prayer, the Church, sacraments and many more.⁹ My main concern will be with Sermon 40 (the tenth and last sermon in the fourth decade) on the rational soul and its immortality (salvation), but I will also reference another influential sermon cycle by Bullinger, his homiletic commentary on Revelation (VD16: B 9635).¹⁰

Melchior Specker (?–1569) was a pastor and professor in Strasbourg. Only the basic outlines of his life are known, and even those only fragmentarily. A native of Isny im Allgäu, he was a student of the great Hebraist Paul Fagius (1504–1549) and ended up teaching, first, logic and metaphysics, and later, theology at the Strasbourg Academy.¹¹ Half a dozen of his works are still extant,¹² and only one of them was reprinted (shortly) after his death. This piece was first published under the title *Vom Leiblichen Todt* in 1560, issued again the next year and finally for a third time, posthumously, in 1571. Consisting of over six hundred pages, it is a bulky book divided into three parts.¹³ It is essentially a collection of thematically arranged quotations taken from the Bible and 1500 years of theological reflection, including the Church Fathers, medieval theologians and Reformation divines, whose names Specker carefully lists at the end of the volume (1560, GG3^{rv}).

7 A quick bibliographic search in VD16 and major library databases shows that by 1600 there existed, in addition to six Latin printings of the complete series (1552, 1557, 1562, 1567, 1577, 1587), numerous editions of translations into major European languages: four in German (1558, 1568, 1597, 1598), five in Dutch (1563, 1567, 1568, 1582, 1595), three in French (1559–1560, 1564, 1565), and four in English (1566, 1577, 1584, 1587). Taken together, these are over twenty editions within half a century, covering most lands where the Swiss Reformation exerted significant influence.

8 For the Latin and German versions there is now a new critical edition (Bullinger: 2008 and 2006, respectively) which appeared as vol. 3. (parts 1–2) of div. 3 of Bullinger's Werke and as vols. 3–5 of his Schriften, respectively. The English translation was edited for the Parker Society by Thomas Harding in the mid-nineteenth century (Bullinger: 1849–1852), which is still available in reprint (New York: Johnson Reprint Corp., 1968 and Grand Rapids, MI: Reformation Heritage Books, 2004).

9 For a theological interpretation, see Opitz: 2004.

10 Its publication history follows a similar pattern to that of the *Decades*. It was written in Latin (1557), in which language it was printed four more times by the very early seventeenth century (1559, 1570, 1590, 1601), but it was also published in German (1558b, 1560, 1587), Dutch (1567, 1581), French (1558, 1564, 1565), and English (1561, 1573) translations.

11 For details, see Archives Biographiques Françaises [ABF], I:966.317, citing Édouard Sitzmann, *Dictionnaire de biographie des hommes célèbres de l'Alsace: Depuis les temps les plus reculés jusqu'à nos jours*, 2 vols., Rixheim 1909–1910, available through WBIS.

12 Cf. VD16: S 8164–8172 and ZV 29061.

13 Pt. 1 (19 chapters, c. 250 pages) on bodily death and its names; pt. 2 (13 chapters, c. 180 pages) deals with the corpse and burial while pt. 3 (12 chapters, c. 140 pages) with the souls and their place and state until judgement day.

Citations appear under a complex system of logically organised rubrics, which provide the material with a four- or five-level structure. I will examine the role Bullinger's sermon plays in the third part of Specker's work.

The third author to be discussed is Johannes Garcaeus, Jr. (1530–1574). His name recognition, commensurate with his oeuvre and impact, falls between the first two authors.¹⁴ His father belonged to Melanchthon's circle. After growing up in Hamburg, Garcaeus returned to Wittenberg, where he had been born, to study theology with the Reformer. Later he accepted positions in Greifswald and Neubrandenburg, became a professor of theology and a superintendent, and also earned a theological doctorate. His literary output exceeds fifty titles, and extends to topics beyond the scope of theology. His works remained in print till the early seventeenth century. His most successful theological piece is the *Sterbbüchlein*, a 300-page octavo volume on the post mortem state of the human soul, which, as I have argued elsewhere, drew in large measure on Specker's *Vom Leiblichen Todt*.¹⁵

3. Bullinger Cited

Turning now to the question of Bullinger's influence upon the two later works, the basic point is easily gained. Specker repeatedly quoted Bullinger and acknowledged him by name, even if he did not always identify the precise locus from which he took his citation. In fact, Bullinger's series of a hundred sermons on Revelation (1557) in Ludwig Lavater's German translation (1558b) is one of Specker's most frequently cited sources. It is mostly used for exegetical purposes as commentary on the relevant biblical verses quoted for a given topic. Its significance is largely "local", pertinent in the narrow context of the scriptural prooftexts in question. I will, therefore, not discuss it much further than to provide an overview of some correspondences illustrating Bullinger's pervasive presence in *Vom Leiblichen Todt*. It is worth noting that in the passages marked with an asterisk (*) in *Table 1*, soul sleep is mentioned, but always with a critical edge.

14 For his biography, see ADB 8:370–371.

15 For details, see my essay (Itzész: 2015b), in which I also argue, on the basis of a dedication dated to 24 June 1568 (Garcaeus: 1573, A4^r) and evidence from Garcaeus' pre-1900 biographers, that we should reckon with a no longer extant editio princeps of 1568, augmenting the available editions (1573, 1577, 1581) and bringing the total number of the *Sterbbüchlein*'s printings to four.